Advice vs. Feedback

Value-Based vs. Objective

Advice, on its own, often supplies students with the answer, rather than leading them to it. Additionally, advice leaves little explanation or relevant support. In contrast, effective feedback is a partnership between the instructor and student that provides the student with objective information, encouraging autonomy and responsibility to further their learning in accordance with his or her goals.

Effective feedback is supported by fact, is related to course concepts, and acknowledges strengths and accomplishments while clearly identifying key areas for improvement. Students will have better context into the instructor’s relevant evaluation of their work and will value the attention and time the instructor took to support their efforts.

Advice

“Heather - You should have included more details in explaining your statistical methods. I would like to have heard more from you. This paper really needed to be at least twice the length.”

Feedback with Advice

“Heather, I enjoyed reading your analysis this week. You are off to a great start! It is clear you have already conducted a significant amount of research for this project and have successfully integrated these references into your text.

In this milestone you were asked to interpret statistical methods or measures. To achieve the highest level of proficiency in this element, you needed to address any given problem, scenario and/or research question. Looking back at the information you’ve collected, what information are you still looking to gain from this project? What questions are you looking to answer? What, if any, problems are you anticipating and how do you plan to address them?

I see you introduced your statistical method of choice. This will be a great option for your final project. To ensure that this statistical method is executed correctly, as well as to meet the requirements of this milestone and the milestones that follow, you will need to provide more detail, background and support to your decision for utilizing this method. By doing this, you should be able to meet the required length of this project.”

Along with his exploration of feedback and advice in Seven Keys to Effective Feedback (2012), Grant Wiggins explores the ineffectiveness of value-based statements. Students often have a negative reaction to subjective feedback that is not relevant or based in fact. Value-based feedback does not address the critical elements of the rubric or the course outcomes. Although some value-based statements are shared with good intention, here are examples of how you can revise or add to your statements to be more objective and effective.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value-Based</th>
<th>Feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I don't understand this paragraph.</td>
<td>The changes in your narrative here take away from your main point, possibly confusing the reader.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great job!</td>
<td>You successfully addressed the critical elements with your thorough analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I love the detail you included here!</td>
<td>The type of detail you included provides the reader with crucial background into the topic.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References